

Appendix K

COMMENTS AND RESPONSES



This page intentionally blank.

SUMMARY OF COMMENTS AND RESPONSES
2024 Plan for the 2012 Annual PM2.5 Standard

This *2024 PM2.5 Plan* was prepared through an involved public process that provided multiple opportunities for the public and interested stakeholders to offer suggestions and comments for improving and strengthening the Plan. The District presented regular updates on the development of this Plan at public meetings, including meetings of District Governing Board, Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC), and Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG), and each update was followed by an opportunity for the public to ask questions or request additional information. The District and CARB also hosted 5 public workshops to discuss, present, and receive feedback on the development of this Plan. See Table K-1 below for a summary of this public process.

Table K-1 2024 PM2.5 Plan Public Process

Date	Meeting Summary
Throughout 2023-2024	Ongoing updates to the District's Governing Board, Citizen's Advisory Committee, and Environmental Justice Advisory Committee meetings.
3/23/2023	Public workshop to present, discuss, and receive feedback on the development of the Plan for the 2012 annual PM2.5 standard, and solicit suggestions for more robust public engagement and suggestions for discussion topics for future workshops.
5/11/2023	Public workshop to present, discuss, and receive feedback on the development of the Plan for the 2012 annual PM2.5 standard, and solicit suggestions for sources of interest, and potential emission reduction opportunities to be included in BACM/MSM analysis.
8/28/2023	Publication of the <i>Draft Initial SIP Requirements</i> on the District website.
9/7/2023	Public workshop to present, discuss, and receive feedback on the development of the Plan for the 2012 annual PM2.5 standard, including results of the precursor and BACM/MSM analyses, and solicit feedback on the <i>Draft Initial SIP Requirements</i> .
9/19/2023	Publication of the Proposed Initial SIP Requirements on the District website, with paper copies available upon request for public review and comment.
10/19/2023	District Governing Board adoption of the <i>Proposed Initial SIP Requirements</i> at a public hearing with opportunities for public comment.
2/15/2024	Public workshop to present, discuss, and receive feedback on the development of the Plan for the 2012 annual PM2.5 standard.
4/26/2024	Publication of draft chapters of the <i>2024 PM2.5 Plan</i> on the District website, with paper copies available upon request for public review and comment.
4/29/2024	Public workshop to present, discuss, and receive feedback on the development of the Plan for the 2012 annual PM2.5 standard.
5/21/2024	Publication of the Proposed <i>2024 PM2.5 Plan</i> on the District website, with paper copies available upon request for public review and comment.
6/20/2024	Public hearing for the adoption of the Proposed <i>2024 PM2.5 Plan</i> with opportunities for public comment.

The public was notified in advance of public workshops via the District's email lists and website. To promote an equitable public process, workshop materials were made available in English and Spanish, and the District provided simultaneous Spanish interpretation during all plan development workshops. Simultaneous interpretation in other languages was made available upon request. In addition, the District conducted the workshops through a hybrid approach, where members of the public are welcome to attend either in person, or join virtually through a real-time webinar environment. This allows for access and engagement opportunities for members of the public who may not be able to attend in person.

Throughout the public process, the District and CARB received verbal comments and questions related to the following topics. The District and CARB provided verbal responses during public workshops as these topics were discussed.

- Low-dust nut harvesters
- Incentives for agricultural equipment
- Receiving credit for reductions achieved through incentive programs
- Building decarbonization and incentives for heat pumps
- Residential wood burning strategy
- Industrial sources
- Ammonia precursor demonstration and control measures
- Commercial charbroiling
- Impact of mobile source measures on goods movement and industry
- Incentives for mobile sources
- Soil NOx
- Title VI
- Health benefits

The District received one written comment during the entirety of the public process, as summarized and responded to below:

COMMENTER:

Rocky Mountain Institute (RMI)

COMMENT: As the Air District builds out its pollution control strategies for the *2023 PM2.5 Plan*, the agency should pursue both near-term and long-term emission reductions through regional zero-NOx appliance standards for space and water heating. (RMI)

RESPONSE: CARB began the public process for the development of zero-emission appliance standards in May 2023. CARB has committed to conduct an extensive investigation into this measure, develop a proposed rule through meaningful public engagement, and bring the proposed rule before their Board by 2025. The District continues to support CARB in the development and implementation of this measure, as it will result in emission reductions and associated health benefits in the San Joaquin Valley.

As part of this Plan, the District is committing to further evaluate potential opportunities to reduce NOx emissions from space and water heating appliances, including implementation of zero-emission requirements earlier than CARB's statewide measure, to the extent that measures are economically and technologically feasible in the Valley. This will require extensive analyses and collaboration across all levels of government, utilities, appliance manufacturers, developers, contractors, households, and businesses to achieve this goal successfully and equitably. In addition to evaluating the feasibility of a regulatory measure, the District will collaborate with utilities, air districts, agencies, and organizations to help leverage funding and coordinate incentives with existing programs that help accelerate the transition to zero-emission space and water heating appliances.

This page intentionally blank.